

Minutes



OF A MEETING OF THE

Planning Committee

HELD AT 6.00PM ON 17 SEPTEMBER 2008

AT COUNCIL OFFICES, CROWMARSH GIFFORD

Present:

Mrs P Slatter (Chairman)

Ms J Bland, Mr F Bloomfield, Mr P Cross, Mr C Daukes (as substitute for Capt J Flood), Mrs E Gillespie, Mr A Hodgson, Mr I Lokhon, Mrs J Murphy (as substitute for Mrs M Turner), Mrs A Midwinter, Mr J Nowell-Smith (as substitute for Mr D Bretherton), Mr R Peasgood, Mr R Peirce, Mr A Rooke

Apologies:

Mr G Andrews, Mr D Bretherton, Mr J Flood and Mrs M Turner tendered apologies for absence.

Officers:

Mr M Brewer, Ms S Crawford, Mr A Duffield, Mrs K Fiander, Miss P Fox, Mr P Lucas, Mr M Moore, Ms S Osborne, Miss J Randle, Ms S Spencer

38. Minutes 27 August 2008

RESOLVED: to approve the minutes of the meeting held on 27 August 2008 as a correct record and to agree that the Chairman sign them.

39. P08/E0324/O, Former Thame United Football Ground, Windmill Road, Thame

Mrs A Midwinter declared a personal and prejudicial interest in this item as Chairman of Thame and District Housing Association, which was located adjacent to the former Thame United Football Ground. In accordance with the provisions in the councillors' code of conduct, she withdrew from the room during the committee's consideration of and voting on the item.

Mr J Nowell-Smith declared a personal and prejudicial interest in this item as Vice Chairman of Thame and District Housing Association, which was adjacent to the former Thame United Football Ground. In accordance with the provisions in the councillors' code of conduct, he withdrew from the room during the committee's consideration of and voting on the item.

The committee considered an application in outline for a residential development of no more than 99 dwellings at the former Thame United Football Ground, Windmill Road, Thame.

The Planning Officer reported that the Environment Agency had confirmed that they did not wish to raise any objection to the development. As a result of discussions with the applicant, the Planning Officer recommended deletion of conditions five and six within his report as these would be better resolved during the processing of the reserved matters submission.

Councillors J Matelot Green and R Parker, representatives of Thame Town Council, addressed the committee on this item.

Mr J Jowitt, agent, addressed the committee in support of the application.

Mr A Payne, objector, addressed the committee objecting to the application.

Mr D Dodds, a ward councillor, addressed the committee on this item.

A motion, moved and seconded, to grant planning permission with deletion of conditions five and six of the officer's report, on being put, was declared carried.

RESOLVED: to authorise the Head of Planning to grant outline planning permission in respect of application P08/E0324/O, Former Thame United Football Ground, Windmill Road, Thame, subject to the completion of the appropriate agreements with:

- a) Oxfordshire County Council to secure financial contributions towards education, libraries, waste management, museum services, social and health care and highway improvements
- b) South Oxfordshire District Council to provide for 40 per cent affordable housing, payment of a recreation contribution and a community facilities contribution and alternative provision made for the Football Club

and subject to the views of Thames Water and the Environment Agency and the following conditions:

1. Approval of reserved matters prior to commencement
2. Submission of reserved matters within three years
3. Commencement within three years or two years of final approval of reserved matters
4. Tree protection
5. Restrict hours of work usage during construction
6. Reserved matters application shall include a scheme for the provision of public art

7. Surface water in accordance with a scheme to be agreed
8. That no development shall commence until a survey of existing foul water drainage provision has been made and it has been shown that the existing system can accommodate the additional foul drainage or that appropriate mitigation has been undertaken in accordance with a scheme to be agreed with the local planning authority in consultation with Thames Water prior to any works commencing
9. Fire hydrant
10. Contamination remediation
11. Green travel plan
12. Access to Windmill Road only

40. P08/E0427, Applecroft, Gravel Road, Binfield Heath

Mr M Leonard, a local ward councillor, who attended the meeting as an observer declared a personal and prejudicial interest in this item on the basis of his association with the objector. In accordance with the provisions in the councillors' code of conduct, he withdrew from the room during the committee's consideration of and voting on the item.

Mr R Peasgood, a local ward councillor, stood down from the committee and took no part in the discussion or voting on this item.

The committee considered an application to erect a two storey four-bedroom dwelling incorporating an integral garage at Applecroft, Gravel Road, Binfield Heath.

Ms C Stockill, objector, addressed the committee objecting to the application.

Mr B Pearson, agent, addressed the committee in support of the application.

Mr R Peasgood, a ward councillor, addressed the committee objecting to the application.

Despite the officer's recommendation of approval, the majority of councillors supported the view that the proposals would constitute an unneighbourly and overbearing development to the adjacent property, Rosedene.

RESOLVED: to refuse planning permission in respect of P08/E0427, Applecroft, Gravel Road, Binfield Heath for the following reason:

The proposed development, by reason of its size and position would result in an overbearing impact and loss light to the rear of Rosedene, to the detriment of the living conditions of the occupiers. The development would therefore be contrary to adopted South Oxfordshire Local Plan 2011 Policies G2, D4, H5 and advice contained in Government Guidance in PPS1 and PPS3.

41. P08/E0167/RET, Hillcrest Cottage, Brook street, Kingston Blount (in the parish of Aston Rowant)

The committee considered a retrospective application to retain an existing two storey extension, rebuilding of the original cottage section and conversion to form two dwellings with parking at Hillcrest Cottage, Brook Street, Kingston Blount.

The Planning Officer recommended a further condition for ventilation to the bedroom to the rear elevation in unit two. This would include a means of escape as a result of the requirement for the window to be obscurely glazed and fixed shut. A second condition would require the building of a retaining wall on the boundary between unit two and the property to the rear of the garden.

Mr S Taylor, agent, addressed the committee in support of the application.

Mrs D Brown, ward councillor, addressed the committee objecting to the application.

Despite the officer's recommendation of approval, councillors supported the view that the design and the materials used at Hillcrest Cottage, Brook Street, Kingston Blount had an adverse impact on the character and appearance of the area.

RESOLVED: to refuse retrospective permission in respect of P08/E0167/RET, Hillcrest Cottage, Brook street, Kingston Blount (in the parish of Aston Rowant) for the following reason:

That having regard to its inappropriate details of design and external materials the development results in a form of development that detracts from the character and appearance of the area and the setting of the adjacent Kingston Blount Conservation Area. Therefore the development is contrary to the provisions of the South Oxfordshire Local Plan 2011, particularly policies G2, G6, H4, H11 and CON7.

42. P08/E0680, Abbeycrest Nursing Home, Essex Way, Kennylands Road, Sonning Common

Mr A Rooke, a local ward councillor, stood down from the committee and took no part in the discussion or voting on this item.

The committee considered an application to demolish all existing buildings and their replacement with a 66 bed care home as a single building together with five suites and six staff rooms and various dining rooms and lounges at Abbeycrest Nursing Home, Essex Way, Kennylands Road, Sonning Common.

The Planning Officer reported that there should be a condition relating to the provision of facilities for waste collection. The scheme showed proper provision but it was important that facilities were provided prior to first use of the care home. He

reported that the OCC library agreement was in place so the recommendation was not subject to anything other than the conditions.

A motion, moved and seconded to grant planning permission, but not subject to an undertaking with OCC and with an additional condition on being put, was declared carried.

RESOLVED: to grant planning permission in respect of P08/E0680, Abbeycrest Nursing Home, Essex Way, Kennylands Road, Sonning Common, subject to the following conditions:

1. Commencement date three years
2. Samples of all new materials
3. Details of brick wall
4. Landscaping scheme (to include details of retained planting)
5. Tree protection
6. Use of the principal building as nursing home only
7. Close care units in association with care home only
8. Details of grey water harvesting, solar panels and other energy saving measures to be agreed. The scheme will include a pre-construction assessment of the close care units
9. Details of lighting scheme to be agreed
10. Contamination investigation
11. Limit hours of construction
12. Surface water drainage scheme
13. Remove permitted development re: fences
14. Demolish existing care home
15. Parking in accordance with approved plan
16. Provision of fire hydrant
17. Foul drainage scheme
18. Staff travel plan
19. Details of rainwater goods to be submitted
20. Facilities for waste collection.

43. P08/W0909, 51 Crown Road, Wheatley

Mr A Hodgson declared a personal and prejudicial interest in this item as a neighbour to the site of the applicant. In accordance with the provisions in the councillors' code of conduct, he addressed the committee as an objector to the application and withdrew from the room during the committee's consideration of and voting on the item.

The committee considered an application to demolish the existing bungalow and replace it with a new detached dwelling with first floor rooms within the roof space lit by dormer windows or rooflights at 51 Crown Road, Wheatley.

The Planning Officer reported receipt of two further letters of objection.

Mrs P Newman, agent, addressed the committee in support of the application.

Mr A Hodgson, objector, addressed the committee objecting to the application.

A motion to refuse planning permission for application P08/W0909, on being put to the vote, was declared carried.

RESOLVED: to refuse planning permission in respect of application P08/W0909, 51 Crown Road, Wheatley for the following reason:

1. That, having regard to the location of the replacement dwelling in relation to the neighbouring property Crown Cottage (47/49 Crown Road) to the height and siting of the new building and the change of roof form in comparison with the existing building, the proposal represents an oppressive and overbearing form of development that would detract from the residential amenity of the occupants of Crown Cottage (47/49 Crown Road). As such, the proposal would be contrary to policies G1 and H4 of the adopted South Oxfordshire Local Plan 2011.

44. P08/W0821/RM 2 Colborne Road, Didcot

Mrs J Murphy declared that she knew the applicant. Having taken advice and considered her position she had decided that she did not have a personal or prejudicial interest in the application and could consider and vote on this item.

The committee considered an application seeking reserved matters for one block of flats of four two-bedroom units and one one-bedroom unit with new vehicular access and amenity space to the side of 2 Colborne Road, Didcot.

The Planning Officer reported that amended plans had been received as a response to the comments from the Crime Protection Design advisor. These had been sent out for consultation and were displayed at the meeting. Five further letters of objection had been received. These related to traffic noise, overlooking, height of building, access and concern at whether the whole scheme would be built.

A motion, moved and seconded, to grant planning permission, on being put, was declared carried.

RESOLVED: to grant planning permission in respect of application P08/W0821/RM 2 Colborne Road, Didcot, subject to the following conditions:

1. That the existing garage at the site entrance onto Colborne Road shall be demolished before the new development hereby permitted commences, and any demolished material which is not to be utilised in the new development shall be removed from the land, unless an alternative scheme for the phased demolition of

the building(s) and removal of materials shall first have been submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning authority

2. Sample materials required (all)
3. Landscaping scheme (trees and shrubs only)
4. That prior to the occupation of any of the flats, the bicycle parking and bin storage shall be provided in accordance with the details on the approved plans and shall be retained as such.
5. Parking and manoeuvring areas retained
6. Sustainable design features - as approved

45. P08/W0610/LB, Cranmer Cottage, 90 High Street, Dorchester on Thames

Mr P Cross, a local ward councillor, stood down from the committee and took no part in the discussion or voting on this item.

The committee considered an application for listed building consent for the renovation of a historic building including the demolition of the existing link between the house and detached kitchen and replacement with a larger link, demolition of a coal shed and construction of a single storey extension at 90 High Street, Dorchester on Thames.

The Planning Officer reported an error in the report. At paragraph 6.13, reference to 28 St Mary's Street, Wallingford should read 24 St Mary's Street, Wallingford.

Mr C Hill, a representative of Dorchester Parish Council, addressed the committee in support of the application.

Mr P Collings, applicant, addressed the committee in support of the application.

Mr J Cotton, a ward councillor, addressed the committee on this item.

A motion, moved and seconded, to grant listed building consent for application P08/W0610/LB, on being put to the vote, was declared lost.

A motion to refuse listed building consent for application P08/W0610/LB, on being put to the vote, was declared carried.

RESOLVED: to refuse listed building consent in respect of application P08/W0610/LB, Cranmer Cottage, 90 High Street, Dorchester on Thames for the following reasons:

1. That, having regard to its massing, height and design which overlaps the principal double-fronted elevation of the dwelling, the proposed porch link would become a dominant feature and destroy the historic relationship between the main house and the former detached outbuilding. As such, the proposal would be

harmful to the special architectural and historic interest of the listed building contrary to Policies CON2 and CON3 of the South Oxfordshire Local Plan 2011, and advice in PPG15 and the South Oxfordshire Design Guide 2008.

2. That the proposed dining room extension is not in keeping with the historic form and character of the former detached outbuilding and that it would obscure more of the historic timber frame of the outbuilding and result in the loss of historic fabric by inserting a new opening through the end wall. As such, the proposal would be harmful to the special architectural and historic interest of a listed building, and result in a loss of historic fabric, contrary to Policies CON2 and CON3 of the South Oxfordshire Local Plan 2011, and advice in PPG15 and the South Oxfordshire Design Guide 2008.
3. That, having regard to the method and extent of the rebuilding of the north wall which involves the complete demolition of that elevation and the removal of the existing roof materials, would involve the unacceptable loss of historic fabric. As such, the proposal would be harmful to the special architectural and historic interest of the listed building, contrary to Policies CON1, CON3 and CON7 of the South Oxfordshire Local Plan 2011 and advice in PPG15.

46. P08/W008/08, Montclair, 29 Winterbrook, Wallingford

Mr I Lokhon declared a personal and prejudicial interest in this item having a close association with a person linked with the property. In accordance with the provisions in the councillors' code of conduct he withdrew from the room during the committee's consideration of and voting on the item.

The committee considered an application to erect a two-storey extension and alterations to the property at 29 Winterbrook, Wallingford.

The Planning Officer reported an omission to the report in that Mrs F Aska should be listed as ward councillor. She also reported that Forestry had no objection to the proposals but requested an additional condition in relation to the pine tree on the site.

Mrs P Newman, agent, and Mr T Wheeler, applicant, addressed the committee in support of the application.

Mrs F Aska, a local ward councillor, addressed the committee in support of the application.

A motion, moved and seconded, to grant planning permission for application P08/W008/08, on being put to the vote, was declared lost.

A motion to refuse planning permission for application P08/W008/08, on being put to the vote, was declared carried.

RESOLVED: to refuse planning permission in respect of application P08/W00808, Montclair, 29 Winterbrook, Wallingford for the following reasons:

1. That having regard to the size, design and form of the existing property and to its location within a historic part of Winterbrook, the proposal to add a large and deep, two storey extension, of an over complicated and cluttered design, would be an unacceptable form of development, out of keeping with the character of the property. The proposal would therefore harm the character of the existing property and the street scene contrary to Policies G6, D1 and H13 of the South Oxfordshire Local Plan.
2. That having regard to the location of Montclair within an historic part of Winterbrook and to the inappropriate form and detailing of the extension, the proposal would have a detrimental impact on the setting of neighbouring listed buildings contrary to Policy CON5 of the adopted South Oxfordshire Local Plan.

The meeting closed at 8.55pm.

Chairman

Date